



**CITY OF PACIFICA
COUNCIL AGENDA SUMMARY REPORT**

2/25/2013

SUBJECT:

Selection of Search Firm for City Manager Recruitment

ORIGINATED BY:

Administrative Services

BACKGROUND/DISCUSSION:

The City Council Subcommittee consisting of Mayor Len Stone and Mayor Pro Tem Mary Ann Nihart worked with City staff members to draft a letter requesting proposals from a list of executive search firms who were recommended by City Council members, other cities, and staff. Of these nine agencies, five submitted proposals by the deadline of Thursday, February 21. The Subcommittee met on Thursday, February 21, 2013 to review the proposals and make a recommendation for the City Council to consider at the February 25, 2013 City Council meeting. For ease of comparison the subcommittee compiled the attached table, summarizing some key characteristics of each proposal. Copies of the complete proposals are also available. In addition, the members of the subcommittee called, or attempted to call, references for each of the agencies.

The Subcommittee reviewed the following proposals

	Recruitment	Reimbursed Fees
Alliance Resource Consulting, Inc.	\$17,000	\$6,000
Avery Associates	\$17,900	\$6,500
Mathis Consulting Group	\$16,950	\$3,000
Bob Murray & Associates	\$18,500	\$6,800
Peckham & McKenney	\$18,000	\$6,500 - \$8,000

Based on the proposals submitted and follow up reference checks, the Subcommittee is recommending that the full City Council interview the following firms: Alliance Resource Consulting, Inc. & Avery Associates. We could interview Bob Murray & Associates if the council desires based on our past experience and positive references.

FISCAL IMPACT:

There is no fiscal impact at this juncture and when a firm is selected additional budget authority will need to be authorized for the contract. The proposals ranged from \$23,000 to \$26,000 depending on reimbursed fees.

COUNCIL ACTION REQUESTED:

The City Council Subcommittee is recommending that the City Council interview Alliance Resource Consulting, Inc. & Avery Associates for the City Manager recruitment.

ATTACHMENT LIST:

Table and Report of Subcommittee for CM recruitment _2_ (PDF)

Summary Table: City Manager Recruitment Agencies responding to RFP

More reference check information will be provided during the Council meeting.

Agency	Experience in Recruitment of the Position and in the Area	Time line	Inclusion of public process in their proposal	Cost	Guar-antee	Description of Search Resources	Unique Characterist ics in proposal	Complete-ness and look of Proposal Inclusion of Example Materials	Response of References Called
Alliance Resource Consulting Northern California Office 228 Hamilton Ave, 3 rd Floor Palo Alto, CA 94301 650-296-1032	Lots of Southern Cal Very national firm Recruited City Manager for East Palo Alto 2 years ago Recent City Manager recruitments in Compton, Tigard,OR, Norwalk, Hillsboro, OR, Seal Beach, El Segundo, Moreno Valley, and Sanger	About 17 weeks	Specifically outlined data they would collect and focus groups plus public meetings they would have and facilitate Plus Online feedback survey	\$17,000 plus expenses NTE \$6500 4 payments	One year	Technology Online Internal Data Basis is large Focus on "ProActive" Recruitment	Unlimited on-site visits within state Local office Progress Report Meeting Long Client List	High Gloss Very Professional Included several recruitment material examples Very complete	Positive response all 5's from one council member Calls placed to other references

<p>William Avery & Associates 3 ½ N Santa Cruz Ave, Los Gatos, CA 95030 408-399-4424</p>	<p>Within past 12 months – recruited city managers for Chico, Los Altos, Riverbank, Menlo Park, Dixon, and Greenfield</p> <p>Both Southern Cal and Northern</p>	<p>About 17 weeks</p>	<p>Suggest creation of a link for feedback on the city website They suggest several methods of gaining input from the public including Survey Monkey Emphasis on key stakeholders</p>	<p>\$17,900 plus expenses NTE \$6500</p> <p>3 payments</p>	<p>One year</p>	<p>Methods and process very clear and detailed</p> <p>Also aggressive as described by others</p>	<p>Mr. Avery was a City Manager</p> <p>Firm also handles labor relations</p>	<p>Complete</p> <p>No extensive client list – provided but recommended by a number of local council members</p> <p>No recruitment material examples</p>	<p>Positive feedback from council members</p> <p>Los Altos very satisfied – all 5's</p>
<p>Mathis Group Napa Valley Office 3435 Valle Verde Dr Napa, CA 94558 707-252-2151</p>	<p>Has recruited successfully City Managers for Azusa, Covina, Colton, interim for Indian Wells, Monrovia, Napa, Sierra Madre, Rancho Cucamonga and Beverly Hills – does not say how recently</p>	<p>Simply says our City timeline is good – no specifics</p>	<p>Mentions meeting with community members and interviewing process with community involvement</p>	<p>\$16,950 with NTE expenses of \$3,000</p> <p>3 payments</p>	<p>One year</p>	<p>Says extensive outreach – process not very clear</p>	<p>Founded by an Organizational Psychologist, authored a number of articles - speaker</p> <p>Sole owner works with wife</p> <p>Also does a number of organizational services – culture building, mentoring, coaching, goal setting etc.</p>	<p>Copy paper three fold</p> <p>Did not include all of the items requested in the RFP such as references</p> <p>Appears to have completed few if any City Manager recruitments</p>	<p>No specific references given to contact – just a client list</p> <p>Called to get them – no response from messages left at office</p>

Bob Murray & Associates 1677 Eureka Rd., Suite 202 Roseville, CA 95661 916-784-9080	Recently worked with Pacifica to recruit our Director of Planning Current City Manager searches El Monte, Concord, and Miami Beach	About 16 weeks	Mentioned they would like public input – no specific mention of the process	\$18,500 plus \$6800 est expenses – no NTE Includes specifically 3 onsite meetings	One year	Aggressive search and contacts in their data base	Mr. Murray was a City Manager for Olympia, WA and the VP was a Director of Public Safety for Sunnyvale 3 days of meetings – additional days must be negotiated	Proposal complete, professional, included recruitment product samples	We have positive experience here (Pacifica) Positive references 4’s & 5’s San Carlos was all 5s – very positive Hired Jeff Maltbie
Peckham & McKenney Executive Search 6700 Freeport Blvd., Suite 203 Sacramento, CA 95822 1-866-912-1919	Has recruited many City Managers including Hayward, Rohnert Park, Redwood City, Santa Clara, Belmont, Woodside and more Very familiar with the area, Recently recruited Burlingame City Manager	About 15 weeks	Describe public process and meetings, wants a tour of city, identified this as an important process No particular mention of internet Did mention focus groups and public forum	\$18,500 plus \$6500 to \$8,000 in expenses (pre-approved) but no limit	Two years	Lots of local contacts Advertising but will also make lots of direct contacts	Only 3 meetings included in the proposal - additional meetings negotiated and billed accordingly including additional expenses Only includes full background check on one candidate	Proposal complete, professional, included recruitment product samples	Burlingame Council Rating: 4’s & 5’s – comment “some things I would change but worked out okay”

Reference Checks were conducted as follows: Rate (lowest) 1 to 5 (highest)

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Community Process | 4. Evaluation and Presentation of Candidates |
| 2. Responsiveness to City Council | 5. Overall Satisfaction |
| 3. Recruitment Strategy - Number of Candidates and Reach | 6. Would you use the firm again - yes or no |

Any other comments or explanation of your ratings: